

Third-order superintegrable systems separable in parabolic coordinates

I. Popper,^{1, a)} S. Post,^{2, b)} and P. Winternitz^{3, c)}

¹⁾*Le Département de Mathématiques et de Statistique, Université de Montréal.
CP6128, Succursale Centre-Ville, Montréal (QC) H3C 3J7,
Canada*

²⁾*Centre de Recherches Mathématiques, Université de Montréal.
CP6128, Succursale Centre-Ville, Montréal (QC) H3C 3J7,
Canada*

³⁾*Le Département de Mathématiques et de Statistique and Centre de Recherches
Mathématiques, Université de Montréal.
CP6128, Succursale Centre-Ville, Montréal (QC) H3C 3J7,
Canada*

In this paper, we investigate superintegrable systems which separate in parabolic coordinates and admit a third-order integral of motion. We give the corresponding determining equations and show that all such systems are multi-separable and so admit two second-order integrals. The third-order integral is their Lie or Poisson commutator. We discuss how this situation is different from the Cartesian and polar cases where new potentials were discovered which are not multi-separable and which are expressed in terms of Painlevé transcendents or elliptic functions.

PACS numbers: 02.30.Ik 45.20.Jj

Keywords: Integrability, Superintegrability, Separation of Variables, Classical and Quantum Mechanics

^{a)}Electronic mail: popperi@DMS.umontreal.ca

^{b)}Electronic mail: post@CRM.umontreal.ca

^{c)}Electronic mail: wintern@CRM.umontreal.ca

I. INTRODUCTION

This article is part of a research program the aim of which is to identify all third-order superintegrable systems in two-dimensional Euclidean space. We recall that a superintegrable system is one that has more integrals of motion than degrees of freedom. We consider a classical or quantum Hamiltonian

$$H = \frac{1}{2}(p_1^2 + p_2^2) + V(x_1, x_2) \quad (1)$$

with two integrals of motion

$$X_a = \sum_{0 \leq j+k \leq n} f_{a,jk}(x_1, x_2) p_1^j p_2^k, \quad a = 1, 2, \quad (2)$$

where p_1, p_2 are components of the momentum $\vec{p}$. In classical mechanics, the integrals $X_{1,2}$ Poisson commute with H , are well defined functions on phase space and the three functions $\{H, X_1, X_2\}$ are functionally independent. The functions X_1 and X_2 do not Poisson commute with each other; instead they generate a non-Abelian algebra, usually a polynomial one. In quantum mechanics, H and X_a are Hermitian operators in the enveloping algebra of the Heisenberg algebra (or some generalization of the enveloping algebra). The operators X_a Lie commute with H , but not with each other. Instead of functional independence, we assume that H, X_1 and X_2 are algebraically independent. More specifically, we assume that no Jordan polynomial in the operators H, X_1 and X_2 vanishes. As indicated in (2), we assume that X_a are polynomials in the momentum. The "order of superintegrability" is the highest order of these polynomials.

The best known superintegrable systems are the Kepler-Coulomb system^{1,7} with potential $V = \alpha/r$ and the harmonic oscillator^{15,28} with $V = \alpha r^2$. As a matter of fact, these are the only rotationally invariant superintegrable systems in n -dimensions ($n \geq 2$) (in agreement with Bertrand's theorem^{2,9}). Both of these systems are quadratically superintegrable in that the Laplace-Runge-Lenz vector for $V = \alpha/r$ and the Fradkin (or quadropole) tensor for $V = \alpha r^2$ are both second-order in the momenta.

Until recently, most studies of superintegrability concentrated on the second-order case^{6,8,24,33,38}. At least in two-dimensional spaces, second-order superintegrable systems are well understood. All such systems in Euclidean spaces, spaces of constant curvature, and spaces of non-constant curvature with at least two second-order Killing tensors (Darboux spaces) have been classified^{16-18,22}.

Recently, infinite families of superintegrable systems with integrals of motion of arbitrary order have been discovered and investigated^{4,19–21,23,26,29,30,32,34,35}.

A systematic search for third-order superintegrable systems was started in 2002, both in classical and quantum mechanics¹¹. However, the first (to our knowledge), article on third-order integrals of motion was written considerably earlier by Drach⁵. He considered the case of one third-order integral of motion (in addition to the Hamiltonian) in flat two-dimensional complex space in classical mechanics. He found 10 different complex potentials which allow a third-order integral. Later it was shown that 7 of them are actually quadratically superintegrable and the third-order integral is reducible, i.e. is the Poisson commutator of two second-order integrals^{31,37}.

The articles in Ref.'s 10, 11 and 36 were devoted to superintegrable systems with one third-order and one first or second-order integral. A first-order integral in $E_2(\mathbb{R})$ exists only if the potential is translationally or rotationally invariant, i.e. $V = V(x)$ or $V = V(r)$. In the classical case, all such potentials are second-order superintegrable and hence known. In quantum mechanics, one class of new superintegrable potentials is obtained¹⁰ and is expressed in terms of elliptical functions, e.g.

$$V = \hbar^2 \omega^2 sn^2(\omega x, k), \quad (3)$$

where ω and k are constants and $sn(\omega x, k)$ is a Jacobian elliptic function³. The existence of a second-order integral implies that $V(x_1, x_2)$ allows separation of variables in Cartesian, polar, parabolic or elliptic coordinates. Cartesian and polar coordinates were considered earlier^{10,36}. The study provided a number of new superintegrable potentials in the classical and, much more interestingly, in the quantum case. Indeed, quantum integrable systems with higher-order integrals of motion can be quite different from classical ones; a fact first noticed by Hietarinta^{12,13}. The case of quantum superintegrable systems is much richer than that of classical ones. Third-order superintegrability with separation of variables in the Schrödinger equation in Cartesian or polar coordinates lead to potentials expressed in terms of Painlevé transcendents (P_I , P_{II} and P_{IV} for Cartesian coordinates, P_{VI} for polar ones). The potentials separable in Cartesian coordinates have been intensively studied in both classical and quantum mechanics^{25–27}.

The purpose of this article is to find all superintegrable systems that allow (at least) one third-order integral and a second-order integral that leads to separation in parabolic

coordinates.

II. THE DETERMINING EQUATIONS

Let us now assume that the Hamiltonian allows separation of variables in parabolic coordinates

$$x_1 = \frac{1}{2}(\xi^2 - \eta^2), \quad x_2 = \xi\eta.$$

The quantum mechanical Hamiltonian has the form

$$H = -\frac{\hbar^2}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial \xi^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \eta^2} \right) + V(\xi, \eta), \quad (4)$$

$$V(\xi, \eta) = \frac{W_1(\xi) + W_2(\eta)}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \quad (5)$$

and there exists a second-order integral of the form

$$Y = L_3 p_2 + p_2 L_3 + \frac{1}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} (\xi^2 W_2(\eta) - \eta^2 W_1(\xi)) \quad (6)$$

with

$$\begin{aligned} p_1 &= -i\hbar \frac{\partial}{\partial x_1} = \frac{-i\hbar}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \left(\xi \frac{\partial}{\partial \xi} - \eta \frac{\partial}{\partial \eta} \right), \\ p_2 &= -i\hbar \frac{\partial}{\partial x_2} = \frac{-i\hbar}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \left(\eta \frac{\partial}{\partial \xi} + \xi \frac{\partial}{\partial \eta} \right), \\ L_3 &= -i\hbar(x_2 p_1 - x_1 p_2) = \frac{i\hbar}{2} \left(\xi \frac{\partial}{\partial \eta} - \eta \frac{\partial}{\partial \xi} \right). \end{aligned}$$

A third-order integral will then have the form

$$X = \sum_{j+k+\ell=3} A_{jkl} \{L_3^j, p_1^k p_2^\ell\} + \{g_1(x_1, x_2), p_1\} + \{g_2(x_1, x_2), p_2\}. \quad (7)$$

The brackets $\{, \}$ denote anti-commutators, A_{jkl} are real constants and the functions V , g_1 , g_2 obey the four partial differential equations presented in Ref. 11 (in Cartesian coordinates). Here we need the equations in parabolic coordinates. To rewrite them in parabolic coordinates, it is convenient to replace the unknown functions $g_1(x_1, x_2)$ and $g_2(x_1, x_2)$ by $G_1(\xi, \eta)$, $G_2(\xi, \eta)$, putting

$$g_1(x_1, x_2) = \frac{\xi G_1(\xi, \eta) - \eta G_2(\xi, \eta)}{\xi^2 + \eta^2}, \quad g_2(x_1, x_2) = \frac{\eta G_1(\xi, \eta) + \xi G_2(\xi, \eta)}{\xi^2 + \eta^2}.$$

The four determining equations for the integral (7), i.e. the commutativity condition $[H, X] = 0$, can be written as

$$G_{1,\xi} - \frac{\xi G_1 - \eta G_2}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} = h_1(\xi, \eta), \quad (8)$$

$$G_{1,\eta} + G_{2,\xi} - 2 \frac{\eta G_1 + \xi G_2}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} = h_2(\xi, \eta), \quad (9)$$

$$G_{2,\eta} + \frac{\xi G_1 - \eta G_2}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} = h_3(\xi, \eta), \quad (10)$$

$$G_1 V_\xi + G_2 V_\eta = \frac{\hbar^2}{4} \phi, \quad (11)$$

with

$$\begin{aligned} h_1(\xi, \eta) &= \frac{3F_1 V_\xi + F_2 V_\eta}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \\ h_2(\xi, \eta) &= \frac{2F_2 V_\xi + 2F_3 V_\eta}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \\ h_3(\xi, \eta) &= \frac{F_3 V_\xi + 3F_4 V_\eta}{\xi^2 + \eta^2}, \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \phi &= \frac{F_1 V_{\xi\xi\xi} + F_2 V_{\xi\xi\eta} + F_3 V_{\xi\eta\eta} + F_4 V_{\eta\eta\eta}}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2} \\ &+ \frac{(3\xi F_1 + 2\eta F_2 - \xi F_3) V_{\xi\xi} + (\eta F_2 - \xi F_2 - \eta F_3 + \xi F_4) V_{\xi,\eta} + (\eta F_2 - 2\xi F_3 - 3\eta F_4) V_{\eta\eta}}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^3} \\ &- \left(\frac{3(\xi^2 - \eta^2)(F_1 - F_3) + 6\xi\eta(F_2 - F_4)}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^4} - 4A_{300}\eta(\xi^2 + \eta^2) + 2A_{201}(\xi + \eta) \right) V_\xi \\ &- \left(\frac{6\xi\eta(F_1 - F_3) - 3(\xi^2 - \eta^2)(F_2 - F_4)}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^4} - 4A_{300}\xi(\xi^2 + \eta^2) - 2A_{201}(\xi + \eta) \right) V_\eta. \end{aligned} \quad (12)$$

The subscripts denote partial derivatives and the expressions F_1, F_2, F_3, F_4 are polynomials in ξ and η :

$$\begin{aligned} F_1 &= \eta^3 A_{003} + \xi \eta^2 A_{012} + \xi^3 A_{030} - \frac{1}{2} \eta^3 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{102} - \frac{1}{2} \xi \eta^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{111} - \frac{1}{2} \eta \xi^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{120} \\ &+ \frac{1}{4} \eta^3 (\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{201} + \frac{1}{4} \xi \eta^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{210} - \frac{1}{8} \eta^3 (\xi^2 + \eta^2)^3 A_{300} + \xi^2 \eta A_{021} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} F_2 &= 3\xi \eta^2 A_{003} - \eta (\eta^2 - 2\xi^2) A_{012} - 3\xi^2 \eta A_{030} - \frac{1}{2} \xi \eta^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{102} + \frac{1}{2} \eta^3 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{111} \\ &+ \frac{1}{2} \xi (\xi^2 + 2\eta^2) (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{120} - \frac{1}{4} \xi \eta^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{201} - \frac{1}{4} \eta (\eta^2 + 2\xi^2) (\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{210} \\ &+ \frac{3}{8} \xi \eta^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2)^3 A_{300} - A_{021} \xi (2\eta^2 - \xi^2) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
F_3 = & 3\xi^2\eta A_{003} - \xi(2\eta^2 - \xi^2)A_{012} + 3\xi\eta^2 A_{030} + \frac{1}{2}\eta\xi^2(\xi^2 + \eta^2)A_{102} + \frac{1}{2}\xi^3(\xi^2 + \eta^2)A_{111} \\
& - \frac{1}{2}\eta(\eta^2 + 2\xi^2)(\xi^2 + \eta^2)A_{120} - \frac{1}{4}\eta\xi^2(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{201} + \frac{1}{4}\xi(\xi^2 + 2\eta^2)(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{210} \\
& - \frac{3}{8}\eta\xi^2(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^3 A_{300} + \eta A_{021}(\eta^2 - 2\xi^2)
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
F_4 = & \xi^3 A_{003} - \xi^2\eta A_{012} - \eta^3 A_{030} + \frac{1}{2}\xi^3(\xi^2 + \eta^2)A_{102} - \frac{1}{2}\eta\xi^2(\xi^2 + \eta^2)A_{111} + \frac{1}{2}\xi\eta^2(\xi^2 + \eta^2)A_{120} \\
& + \frac{1}{4}\xi^3(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{201} - \frac{1}{4}\eta\xi^2(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2 A_{210} + \frac{1}{8}\xi^3(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^3 A_{300} + \xi\eta^2 A_{021}.
\end{aligned}$$

The determining equations (8-10) are the same in classical and quantum mechanics but (11) contains the Planck constant on the right hand side. The corresponding equation in classical mechanics is obtained by taking the limit $\hbar \rightarrow 0$ so (11) is greatly simplified. Hence the difference between classical and quantum integrability (and superintegrability) for third-order integrals of motion.

The system (8-11) is overdetermined. The first three equations imply a linear compatibility condition for the potential

$$\begin{aligned}
0 = & F_3 V_{\xi\xi\xi} + (3F_4 - 2F_2)V_{\xi\xi\eta} + (3F_1 - 2F_3)V_{\xi\eta\eta} + F_2 V_{\eta\eta\eta} \\
& + \left(2(F_{3\xi} - F_{2\eta}) - \frac{3\xi F_1 - 6\eta F_2 + 7\xi F_3}{\xi^2 + \eta^2}\right) V_{\xi\xi} + \left(2(F_{2\eta} - F_{3\xi}) - \frac{3\eta F_4 - 6\xi F_3 + 7\eta F_2}{\xi^2 + \eta^2}\right) V_{\eta\eta} \\
& + \left(2(3F_{1\eta} - F_{2\xi} - F_{3\eta} + 3F_{4\xi}) - \frac{21\eta F_1 - 5\eta F_3 - 5\xi F_2 + 21\xi F_4}{\xi^2 + \eta^2}\right) V_{\xi\eta} \\
& + A V_\eta + B V_\xi,
\end{aligned} \tag{13}$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
A = & F_{2\eta\eta} - 2F_{3\eta\xi} + 3F_{4\xi\xi} + \frac{-7\eta F_{2\eta} - \xi F_{2\xi} + 6\xi F_{3\eta} + 6\eta F_{3\xi} - 3\eta F_{4\eta} - 21\xi F_{4\xi}}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \\
& + 2 \frac{21\xi^2 F_4 + F_2 \xi^2 + 7\eta^2 F_2 - 12\xi\eta F_3 + 3F_4 \eta^2}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2} \\
B = & 3F_{1\eta\eta} - 2F_{2\eta\xi} + F_{3\xi\xi} - \frac{21\eta F_{1\eta} + 3\xi F_{1\xi} - 6\xi F_{2\eta} - 6\eta F_{2\xi} + \eta F_{3\eta} + 7\xi F_{3\xi}}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \\
& + 2 \frac{F_3 \eta^2 + 3F_1 \xi^2 + 21\eta^2 F_1 - 12\xi\eta F_2 + 7\xi^2 F_3}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^2}.
\end{aligned}$$

Compatibility between the first three determining equations (8-10) and the fourth one (11) requires three more conditions, this time nonlinear ones. Indeed, solving (11) for G_2 , we have

$$G_2 = \frac{1}{V_\eta} \left(\frac{\hbar^2}{4} \Phi - V_\xi G_1 \right), \quad V_\eta \neq 0. \tag{14}$$

Replacing G_2 from (14) into (8-10), the system can then be solved for G_1 ,

$$G_1 = \frac{h_4}{h_5}, \quad G_2 = \frac{h_5 \hbar^2 \Phi - 4V_\xi h_4}{4h_5 V_\eta}, \quad h_5 \neq 0, \quad (15)$$

with

$$h_4 = (\xi^2 + \eta^2) (4h_3 V_\eta^3 + 4h_2 V_\xi V_\eta^2 + 4h_1 V_\xi^2 V_\eta - \hbar^2 V_\eta^2 \Phi_\eta - \hbar^2 V_\xi V_\eta \Phi_\xi - \hbar^2 (V_{\eta\eta} V_\eta - V_{\xi\eta} V_\xi) \Phi) \\ + 4\eta V_\xi^2 - 4\eta V_\eta^2 - 8\xi V_\eta V_\xi$$

$$h_5 = 4(\xi^2 + \eta^2) (V_\xi V_\eta (V_{\xi\xi} - V_{\eta\eta} + (V_\eta^2 - V_\xi^2) V_{\xi\eta}) + 4(\eta V_\xi - \xi V_\eta) (V_\xi^2 + V_\eta^2)).$$

Replacing (15), into (8-10), gives the three additional non-linear compatibility conditions on the potential, namely

$$\left(\frac{h_4}{h_5} \right)_\xi + \frac{\eta \hbar^2 h_5 \Phi + 4h_4 (\xi V_\eta + \eta V_\xi)}{4h_5 V_\eta (\xi^2 + \eta^2)} = h_1 \quad (16)$$

$$\left(\frac{h_4}{h_5} \right)_\eta + \left(\frac{\hbar^2 h_5 \Phi - 4V_\xi h_4}{4h_5 V_\eta} \right)_\xi + \frac{\xi \hbar^2 h_5 \Phi + 4h_4 (\eta V_\eta - \xi V_\xi)}{2h_5 V_\eta (\xi^2 + \eta^2)} = h_2 \quad (17)$$

$$\left(\frac{\hbar^2 h_5 \Phi - 4V_\xi h_4}{4h_5 V_\eta} \right)_\eta - \frac{\eta \hbar^2 h_5 \Phi + 4h_4 (\xi V_\eta + \eta V_\xi)}{4h_5 V_\eta (\xi^2 + \eta^2)} = h_3. \quad (18)$$

III. GENERAL FORMS FOR W_1 AND W_2

In order to determine all possible potentials which separate in parabolic coordinates and admit a third-order integral of motion, we begin with the linear compatibility condition (13). Replacing V with the form as in (5), the compatibility condition can be differentiated to obtain a system of linear ordinary differential equations (ODEs) for W_1 and W_2 . These equations are given in Appendix A for W_1 . Notice that interchanging ξ and η has the effect of changing the sign of the coefficients to $(-1)^{j+k} A_{jkl}$. Thus, equations for W_2 are of the same form as (A1-A14), up to a change in sign in these constants. We begin our search for the admissible potentials by solving equations (A1-A14).

Theorem 1 *Given a Hamiltonian which admits a third-order integral of motion with a potential which separates in parabolic coordinates as in (5). Then any admissible terms in the potential are included in*

$$W_1(\xi) = \sum_{j=0}^{16} c_j \xi^j + c_{-2} \xi^{-2} + c_{-4} \xi^{-4} + c_{-6} \xi^{-6} + \frac{\alpha_1 \xi \ln \left(\xi + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1} \right) + \alpha_2 \xi}{\sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}}, \quad (19)$$

$$W_2(\eta) = \sum_{j=1}^{16} d_j \eta^j + d_{-2} \eta^{-2} + d_{-4} \eta^{-4} + d_{-6} \eta^{-6} + \frac{\beta_1 \ln \left(\eta + \sqrt{\eta^2 + B_2} \right) + \beta_2 \eta}{\sqrt{\eta^2 + B_2}}. \quad (20)$$

In particular, any solution of the system (13) has the form (5) with W_1 and W_2 as in (19) and (20) with appropriately chosen constants.

Proof: Beginning with (A1), in the case that $A_{300} \neq 0$, the solutions are given by

$$W_1 = \sum_{i=0}^{14} c_i \xi^i + c_{-2} \xi^{-2} + c_{-4} \xi^{-4}. \quad (21)$$

Similarly, for (A2), in the case that $A_{210} \neq 0$, the solutions are

$$W_1 = \sum_{i=0}^{15} c_i \xi^i + c_{-2} \xi^{-2}. \quad (22)$$

Equation (A3) in addition requires that $c_{14} = c_{15} = 0$.

Now assume $A_{300} = A_{210} = 0$. This sets (A1-A3) to be satisfied identically and (A4) becomes

$$- \left((\xi^2 A_{201} + 2 A_{120}) \frac{d^{17}}{d\xi^{17}} + 33\xi A_{201} \frac{d^{16}}{d\xi^{16}} + 255 A_{201} \frac{d^{15}}{d\xi^{15}} \right) W_1 = 0. \quad (23)$$

The solutions of (23), assuming $A_{201} \neq 0$, are

$$W_1 = \sum_{i=0}^{14} c_i \xi^i + \frac{\alpha_1 \xi \ln \left(\xi + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1} \right) + \alpha_2 \xi}{\sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}}. \quad (24)$$

with $A_{120} = B_1 A_{201}/2$. If $A_{201} = 0$, the solutions are

$$W_1 = \sum_{i=0}^{16} c_i \xi^i. \quad (25)$$

Now assume $A_{300} = A_{210} = A_{201} = A_{120} = 0$, (A1-A4) are then identically satisfied and (A5) becomes

$$\frac{1}{2} \left((A_{102} \xi^2 + 2 A_{021}) \frac{d^{17}}{d\xi^{17}} + 255 A_{102} \frac{d^{15}}{d\xi^{15}} + 33\xi A_{102} \frac{d^{16}}{d\xi^{16}} \right) W_1 = 0. \quad (26)$$

The solutions of (26) for $A_{102} \neq 0$ are as (24) with $A_{021} = 2 A_{102} B_1$ and for $A_{102} = 0$ are as (25).

If we now assume $A_{300} = A_{210} = A_{201} = A_{120} = A_{102} = A_{021} = 0$, (A6) becomes

$$A_{003} \left[3 \xi^2 \frac{d^{17}}{d\xi^{17}} + 111 \xi \frac{d^{16}}{d\xi^{16}} + 969 \frac{d^{15}}{d\xi^{15}} \right] W_1 = 0, \quad (27)$$

the solutions of which are given by (21).

Now, assume $A_{300} = A_{210} = A_{201} = A_{120} = A_{102} = A_{021} = A_{003} = 0$, this implies (A1-A6) as well as (A10-A12) are identically satisfied. Equation (A7) becomes

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\xi (A_{111}\xi^2 + 6A_{030} - 4A_{012})}{2} \frac{d^{17}}{d\xi^{17}} W_1 + \left(\frac{51}{2} A_{111}\xi^2 - 36A_{12} + 54A_{030} \right) \frac{d^{16}}{d\xi^{16}} W_1 \\ + \frac{813\xi A_{111}}{2} \frac{d^{15}}{d\xi^{15}} W_1 + 2016A_{111} \frac{d^{14}}{d\xi^{14}} W_1 = 0. \end{aligned} \quad (28)$$

The general solutions of (28) are of the form

$$W_1 = \sum_{i=0}^{13} c_i \xi^i + c_{-2} \xi^{-2} + \frac{\alpha_1 \xi \ln(\xi + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}) + \alpha_2 \xi}{\sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}}, \quad (29)$$

with $A_{030} = \frac{1}{6}B_1 A_{111} + \frac{2}{3}A_{012}$ for $A_{111} \neq 0$ and of the form (22) for $A_{111} = 0$.

Now assume that $A_{300} = A_{210} = A_{201} = A_{120} = A_{102} = A_{021} = A_{003} = A_{111} = 3A_{030} - 2A_{012} = 0$, this implies that (A14) has the form

$$A_{012} \left(\xi^3 \frac{d^{17}}{d\xi^{17}} + 57\xi^2 \frac{d^{16}}{d\xi^{16}} + 1023\xi \frac{d^{15}}{d\xi^{15}} + 5760 \frac{d^{14}}{d\xi^{14}} \right) W_1 = 0. \quad (30)$$

The solutions of (30) for $A_{012} \neq 0$ are given by

$$W_1 = \sum_{i=0}^{14} c_i \xi^i + c_{-2} \xi^{-2} + c_{-4} \xi^{-4} + c_{-6} \xi^{-6}. \quad (31)$$

This is the final case, since assuming $A_{012} = 0$ in addition to $A_{300} = A_{210} = A_{201} = A_{120} = A_{102} = A_{021} = A_{003} = A_{111} = 3A_{030} - 2A_{012} = 0$ has all the A's equal 0 and so there is no longer a third order term in our constant of motion.

Thus, the most general form of the function W_1 is given by (19). By direct analogy, the most general form of the function W_2 is given by (20).

□

Corollary 1 *The potential for any 3rd-order superintegrable system which separates in parabolic coordinates satisfies a non-trivial system of linear ODEs for both W_1 and W_2 .*

Proof As shown above, the compatibility conditions (13) are satisfied identically if and only if all the A_{ijk} are 0. On the other hand, if there is a non-zero A_{ijk} then the functions W_1 and W_2 in the potential will satisfy some linear ODEs.

□

IV. THE ABSENCE OF IRRATIONAL TERMS

In this section, we show that the only possible form of the potential is as a rational function of ξ and η . We shall show this by contradiction. Namely, we consider the case that either $\alpha_1 \neq 0$ or both $\alpha_2 \neq 0$ and $B_1 \neq 0$ in (19).

If we substitute the general form (19) into equations (A1-A14), it is immediate from the previous section that $A_{300} = A_{210} = 0$. We also obtain the following possible restrictions on the constants, as suggested in the previous section:

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} A_{003} = A_{021} = \frac{B_1(A_{102} - A_{120})}{2}, \\ A_{012} = A_{030} = \frac{A_{111}B_1}{2}, \\ A_{201} = \frac{2A_{120}}{B_1}. \end{array} \right\} \quad (32)$$

In the case that $B_1 \neq 0$, W_1 becomes

$$W_1 = c_0 + c_1\xi + c_2\xi^2 + c_3\xi^3 + c_4\xi^4 + c_5\xi^5 + c_6\xi^6 + \frac{c_{-2}}{\xi^2} + \frac{\alpha_1\xi \ln(\xi + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}) + \alpha_2\xi}{\sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}}, \quad (33)$$

with the following cases

$$\begin{aligned} &\{B_1 \neq 0, c_{-2} = c_5 = c_6 = 0\} \\ &\{B_1 \neq 0, A_{201} = 0, c_{-2} = c_6 = 0\} \\ &\{B_1 \neq 0, A_{111} = A_{201} = 0, c_{-2} = 0\} \\ &\{B_1 \neq 0, A_{102} = A_{201} = 0\}. \end{aligned} \quad (34)$$

In the case that $\alpha_1 \neq 0$ and $B_1 = 0$, W_1 becomes

$$W_1 = c_0 + c_1\xi + c_2\xi^2 + c_3\xi^3 + c_4\xi^4 + c_5\xi^5 + c_6\xi^6 + \frac{c_{-2}}{\xi^2} + \frac{c_{-4}}{\xi^2} + \alpha_1 \ln(\xi), \quad (35)$$

with the following cases

$$\begin{aligned} &\{\alpha_1 \neq 0, B_1 = 0, c_{-4} = c_5 = c_6 = 0\} \\ &\{\alpha_1 \neq 0, B_1 = 0, A_{201} = 0, c_{-4} = c_6 = 0\} \\ &\{\alpha_1 \neq 0, B_1 = 0, A_{111} = A_{201} = 0, c_{-4} = 0\} \\ &\{\alpha_1 \neq 0, B_1 = 0, A_{102} = A_{201} = 0\}. \end{aligned} \quad (36)$$

Note that when $B_1 = 0$, α_2 becomes an additive constant which is absorbed into c_0 .

Next, we substitute these cases (34) or (36), along with the forms of W_1 (33) or (35) and W_2 (20), into the compatibility condition (13) to obtain

$$0 = M_2 \ln(\eta^2 + \sqrt{\eta^2 + B_2}) + M_1 \sqrt{\eta^2 + B_2} + M_0 \quad (37)$$

where the M_i are rational functions which are too long to be presented here but are available from the authors upon request. Solving $M_2 = 0$ gives 3 possibilities: either $\beta_1 = 0$, $B_2 = -B_1$ or, in the case that B_1 is not zero, B_2 may vanish if additionally $A_{111} = 0$ and $A_{102} = B_1 A_{201}/2$.

Solving $M_1 = 0$ and $M_0 = 0$ gives similar forms for W_2 : If $B_1 \neq 0$, then W_2 has the form

$$W_2 = d_1\eta + c_2\eta^2 - c_4\eta^4 + c_6\eta^6 + \frac{c_{-2}}{\eta^2} + \frac{-\alpha_1\eta \ln(\eta + \sqrt{\eta^2 + B_2}) + \beta_2\eta}{\sqrt{\eta^2 + B_2}} \quad (38)$$

and if $B_1 = 0$, then it has the form

$$W_2 = c_2\eta^2 - c_4\eta^4 + c_6\eta^6 + \frac{c_{-2}}{\eta^2} - \frac{c_{-4}}{\eta^4} - \alpha_1 \ln(\eta). \quad (39)$$

In both cases, c_3 and c_5 are also required to be 0 as well and as several additional sets of constraints which are required to completely solve (13). We shall return to some of these cases later.

To obtain a contradiction for the potentials admitting logarithmic singularities, we now turn our attention to the non-linear compatibility conditions. Beginning with Eq. (16), we clear the denominator and consider the equation

$$0 = h_5^2 V_\eta(\xi^2 + \eta^2) \left[\left(\frac{h_4}{h_5} \right)_\xi + \frac{\eta h^2 h_5 \Phi + 4h_4 (\xi V_\eta + \eta V_\xi)}{4h_5 V_\eta(\xi^2 + \eta^2)} - h_1 \right]. \quad (40)$$

In the case that both α_1 and B_1 are assumed non-zero, equation (40) will have polynomial dependence on the quantity $\ln(\xi^2 + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1})$. Substituting the forms of the potential obtained above (33) and (38) into this quantity, (40), gives

$$0 = 32\alpha^6 B_1^3 K \ln^6(\xi^2 + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}) + \mathcal{O}(\ln^5(\xi^2 + \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1})), \quad (41)$$

$$K = 9A_{111}\eta\xi^{14} + \frac{9A_{111}}{2}(16\eta^2 + 5B_1)\xi^{12} + (2(48A_{102} - 23A_{201})\eta^2 - B_1(16A_{102} - 11A_{201}))\eta^2\xi^{11} + \mathcal{O}(\xi^{10}). \quad (42)$$

Therefore, since it was assumed that $\alpha_1 \neq 0$ and $B_1 \neq 0$, the condition (40) requires that $A_{111} = A_{102} = A_{201} = 0$ which is a contradiction because in this case all of the A_{jkl} 's would be identically zero. In the case that $B_1 = 0$, (40) is a polynomial in $\ln \xi$ with leading order term

$$0 = \frac{K}{(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^{10}\xi^4\eta^3} \ln^4 \xi + \mathcal{O}(\ln^3 \xi) \quad (43)$$

$$K = 192\alpha_1^6 A_{111}\xi^{12}\eta^2 - 640\alpha_1^6 A_{102}\xi^{11}\eta^3 - 32(864d_{-2}c_4 A_{102} + \alpha^2 A_{201})\alpha^4 \xi^{13}\eta^3 + \dots \quad (44)$$

For simplicity, we give only the most relevant terms instead of the highest order ones in K . From these terms, it can be seen that the condition (40) leads to a contradiction since they would imply A_{201} , A_{102} and A_{111} are all 0 and so every A_{jkl} would vanish. Thus, there are no logarithmic singularities in the potential.

Next, we turn in particular to the case that $\alpha_1 = \beta_1 = 0$. In this case, we proceed slightly differently because computationally, it is more difficult for MAPLE to compute coefficients of the expression (40) with respect to $(\xi^2 + \eta^2)^{k/2}$ without first simplifying the entire expression. On the other hand, unlike in the previous section, we can solve (8-10) without much difficulty and replace the integrated forms of G_1 and G_2 into (11) to obtain the needed contradictions.

In this case, we require the complete solutions for (13). Namely, W_1 must satisfy (33) with $c_3 = c_5 = 0$ and W_2 must satisfy (38), both with $\alpha_1 = \beta_1 = 0$. Additionally, the constants satisfy one of the following cases:

$$\{B_2 = -B_1, A_{201} = A_{102} = 0, c_0 = c_1 = d_1 = c_6 = 0\} \quad (45)$$

$$\{B_2 = -B_1, A_{201} = A_{111} = 0, c_0 = c_1 = d_1 = c_{-2} = 0\} \quad (46)$$

$$\{B_2 = -B_1, A_{111} = 0, A_{102} = A_{120}, c_1 = d_1 = c_6 = c_{-2} = 0\} \quad (47)$$

$$\{B_2 = 0, A_{111} = 0, A_{102} = A_{120}, c_0 = c_1 = d_1 = c_6 = c_{-2} = 0\} \quad (48)$$

$$\{B_2 = -B_1, c_0 = c_1 = d_1 = c_6 = c_{-2} = 0\}. \quad (49)$$

There is also a complex solution for the constants

$$\{B_2 = -B_1, A_{201} = 0, A_{111} = iA_{102}, d_1 = ic_1, c_0 = c_6 = c_{-2} = 0\}. \quad (50)$$

To obtain the needed contradictions, we use the obtained sets of solutions for (13) to solve (8-10) for G_1 and G_2 and replace these solutions into (11). For example, in the case identified in (45) the relevant G' s are

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 = & \left(\frac{-(-3B_1\xi^2 + 4\xi^2\eta^2 + \eta^2B_1)\alpha_2}{2\sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1}(\xi^2 + \eta^2)} + \frac{\xi\eta(-\eta^2 + 2B_1 + \xi^2)\beta_2}{\sqrt{\eta^2 - B_1}(\xi^2 + \eta^2)} \right. \\ & \left. - 1/2(2\eta^4 + \eta^2B_1 + 4\xi^2\eta^2 - 3B_1\xi^2)\xi c_4 - \frac{(\eta^2 - \xi^2 - B_1)c_{-2}}{\eta^2\xi} \right) A_{111} \\ & + \frac{\eta(\xi^2 + \eta^2)}{6}k_1 + \eta k_2 + \xi k_3 \end{aligned} \quad (51)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
G_2 = & \left(-\frac{\xi \eta (-\eta^2 + 2 B_1 + \xi^2) \alpha_2}{\sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1} (\xi^2 + \eta^2)} - 1/2 \frac{(-B_1 \xi^2 + 4 \xi^2 \eta^2 + 3 \eta^2 B_1) \beta_2}{\sqrt{\eta^2 - B_1} (\xi^2 + \eta^2)} \right. \\
& + 1/2 \eta (2 \xi^4 - B_1 \xi^2 + 4 \xi^2 \eta^2 + 3 \eta^2 B_1) c_4 + \frac{(\eta^2 - \xi^2 - B_1) c_{-2}}{\xi^2 \eta} \Big) A_{111} \\
& - \frac{\xi(\xi^2 + \eta^2)}{6} k_1 - \eta k_3 + \xi k_2,
\end{aligned} \tag{52}$$

where k_1, k_2 and k_3 are constants of integration. These solutions for G_1 and G_2 when substituted into (11) give

$$0 = T_1 \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1} \sqrt{\eta^2 - B_1} + T_2 \sqrt{\xi^2 + B_1} + T_3 \sqrt{\eta^2 - B_1} + T_4. \tag{53}$$

Again, the T_i 's are rational functions of ξ and η , and can be obtained from the authors. Solving these systems, we obtain $\beta_2 = 0$ and $\alpha_2 = 0$ or $A_{111}=0$, which gives a contradiction, since in these cases either all of the A_{jkl} are zero or the potential reduces to a rational function. By checking each case in this manner, we find that when B_1 is assumed to be non-zero the potentials reduce to rational functions.

Thus, we have shown by contradiction that the only possible potentials which satisfy both the linear (13) and nonlinear (16-18) compatibility conditions are rational functions of ξ and η .

V. FINAL LIST OF SUPERINTEGRABLE POTENTIALS

Since there are no longer any irrational terms in the potential, it is a straightforward computation to find the admissible choices of constants which satisfy the linear compatibility condition (13), to use these choices to solve the linear partial differential equations (8-10) for G_1 and G_2 and to solve the resulting algebraic system determined by the coefficients of (11). In this section, we exhibit the possible potentials which remain, i.e. those potentials which separate in parabolic coordinates and admit a third order integral of motion. Remarkably, the only such potentials are second-order superintegrable. These are exactly the potentials which separate in parabolic coordinates as well as another orthogonal coordinate system in $E_2(\mathbb{R})$. We also obtain a potential in $E(1,1)$ which is presented in Appendix B.

It is interesting to note that, in addition to the systems which admit a single third-order integral, this method allows us to obtain potentials in the quantum case which admit more than one third-order integral. Furthermore, these additional potentials give proof

that the quantum correction to (11), namely Φ , is not identically 0 for potentials which are superintegrable in both the classical and quantum cases. The quantity Φ only vanishes when, in addition, the appropriate choices of A_{jkl} are assumed. For example, for potential V_1 below, the quantity Φ vanishes only when all of the A_{jkl} 's are assumed 0 except for A_{012} .

A. Potentials which admit a single third-order integral

1. A deformation of the anisotropic oscillator potential: V_1

The following potential

$$\begin{aligned} V_1 &= (\eta^4 - \xi^2 \eta^2 + \xi^4) \alpha + \beta(\xi^2 - \eta^2) + \frac{\gamma}{\xi^2 \eta^2} \\ &= \alpha(4x^2 + y^2) + 2\beta x + \frac{\gamma}{y^2} \\ &= \alpha r^2(3 \cos^2 \theta + 1) + 2\beta r \cos \theta + \frac{\gamma}{r^2 \sin^2 \theta} \end{aligned} \quad (54)$$

admits a third-order integral with all $A_{jkl} = 0$ except A_{021} and functions

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= 2 \frac{A_{012}(-2\alpha \xi^2 \eta^6 + \eta^4 \alpha \xi^4 + \eta^4 \beta \xi^2 + \gamma)}{\xi \eta^2} \\ G_2 &= -2 \frac{A_{012}(-2\eta^2 \alpha \xi^6 + \eta^4 \alpha \xi^4 - \eta^2 \beta \xi^4 + \gamma)}{\eta \xi^2}. \end{aligned}$$

2. A deformation of the Coulomb potential: V_2

The following potential

$$\begin{aligned} V_2 &= \frac{1}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \left(\frac{\alpha}{\xi^2} + \frac{\beta}{\eta^2} + \gamma \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{2\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} \left(\frac{\alpha}{x + \sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} + \frac{\beta}{x - \sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} + \gamma \right) \\ &= \frac{\alpha}{2r^2(\cos \theta + 1)} - \frac{\beta}{2r^2(\cos \theta - 1)} + \frac{\gamma}{2r} \end{aligned} \quad (55)$$

admits one third-order constant of motion with all $A_{jkl} = 0$ except A_{210} and functions

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= \frac{A_{210}(2\eta^4 \gamma \xi^2 + 2\eta^4 \alpha + 4\xi^2 \beta \eta^2 - \eta^2 \xi^2 h^2 + 2\xi^4 \beta)}{4\xi \eta^2} \\ G_2 &= -\frac{A_{210}(2\xi^4 \beta + 2\xi^4 \gamma \eta^2 + 4\xi^2 \alpha \eta^2 - \eta^2 \xi^2 h^2 + 2\eta^4 \alpha)}{4\eta \xi^2}. \end{aligned}$$

3. A second deformation of the Coulomb potential: V_3

The following potential

$$\begin{aligned}
V_3 &= \frac{\alpha \xi + \beta \eta + \gamma}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \\
&= \frac{1}{2\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} \left(\alpha \sqrt{x + \sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} + \beta \sqrt{\sqrt{x^2 + y^2} - x + \gamma} \right) \\
&= \frac{1}{2r} \left(\alpha \sqrt{2} \cos \frac{\theta}{2} + \beta \sqrt{2} \sin \frac{\theta}{2} + \gamma \right)
\end{aligned} \tag{56}$$

admits one third-order integral associated with A_{102} (all the remaining $A_{jkl} = 0$)

$$\begin{aligned}
G_1 &= -\frac{1}{2} A_{102} (-\beta \xi^2 + \beta \eta^2 + 2\eta \alpha \xi + 2\eta \gamma) \\
G_2 &= \frac{1}{2} A_{102} (\alpha \xi^2 - \alpha \eta^2 + 2\xi \gamma + 2\eta \xi \beta).
\end{aligned}$$

B. Potentials which admit more than one third-order integrals

The following potentials are sub-cases of those from the previous section, in the quantum cases. They admit at least two third-order integrals.

1. V_1 subcases

The following potential

$$\begin{aligned}
V_{1,a} &= \beta (\xi^2 - \eta^2) + \frac{h^2}{\xi^2 \eta^2} \\
&= 2\beta x + \frac{\hbar^2}{y^2}.
\end{aligned} \tag{57}$$

admits three linearly independent third-order integrals associated with the constants A_{012} , A_{003} and A_{102} (the remaining A_{jkl} 's are 0). The functions G_1 and G_2 are

$$\begin{aligned}
G_1 &= -\frac{(3h^2\eta^2 - h^2\xi^2 + 2\eta^4\xi^4\beta) A_{102}}{2\eta\xi^2} + 3\frac{h^2 A_{003}}{\eta\xi^2} + 2\frac{(\eta^4\xi^2\beta + h^2) A_{012}}{\xi\eta^2} \\
G_2 &= -\frac{(-3h^2\xi^2 + h^2\eta^2 + 2\xi^4\eta^4\beta) A_{102}}{2\xi\eta^2} + 3\frac{h^2 A_{003}}{\xi\eta^2} + 2\frac{(\xi^4\eta^2\beta - h^2) A_{012}}{\eta\xi^2}.
\end{aligned}$$

2. V_2 subcases

The following potential

$$\begin{aligned} V_{2,a} &= \frac{\gamma}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} + \frac{h^2}{\xi^2 \eta^2} \\ &= \frac{\gamma}{2r} + \frac{\hbar^2}{r^2 \sin^2 \theta}. \end{aligned} \quad (58)$$

admits two linearly independent third-order integrals associated with the constants A_{300} and A_{210} (the remaining A_{jkl} 's are 0). The functions G_1 and G_2 are

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= -\frac{h^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) (3\xi^4 + 2\xi^2\eta^2 + 3\eta^4) A_{300}}{8\eta\xi^2} + \frac{(3\eta^2\xi^2h^2 + 2\eta^4\gamma, \xi^2 + 2\eta^4h^2 + 2\xi^4h^2) A_{210}}{4\eta^2\xi} \\ G_2 &= \frac{h^2 (\xi^2 + \eta^2) (3\xi^4 + 2\xi^2\eta^2 + 3\eta^4) A_{300}}{8\xi\eta^2} - \frac{(3\eta^2\xi^2h^2 + 2\xi^4h^2 + 2\eta^2\xi^4\gamma + 2\eta^4h^2) A_{210}}{4\eta\xi^2}. \end{aligned}$$

Another subcase of the potential V_2 which admits three linearly independent third-order integrals is given by

$$\begin{aligned} V_{2,b} &= \frac{1}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} \left(\gamma + \frac{h^2}{\xi^2} \right) \\ &= \frac{\gamma}{2r} + \frac{\hbar^2}{2r^2(1 + \cos \theta)}. \end{aligned} \quad (59)$$

The integrals are associated with coefficients A_{300} , A_{210} and A_{201} with the remaining $A_{jkl} = 0$ and functions

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= \frac{h^2\eta (3\eta^2 + 2\xi^2) (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{300}}{8\xi^2} + \frac{(2h^2\eta^2 + 2\eta^2\xi^2\gamma - h^2\xi^2) A_{210}}{4\xi} \\ &\quad - \frac{A_{201}\eta (2\xi^4\gamma - 3h^2\eta^2)}{4\xi^2} \\ G_2 &= \frac{h^2 (3\eta^2 + 2\xi^2) (\xi^2 + \eta^2) A_{300}}{8\xi} - \frac{\eta (2\xi^4\gamma + 2h^2\eta^2 + 3h^2\xi^2) A_{210}}{4\xi^2} \\ &\quad + \frac{A_{201} (2\xi^4\gamma - h^2\eta^2)}{4\xi}. \end{aligned}$$

C. Potentials admitting group symmetry

The following potentials admit a Killing vector associated with group symmetry.

1. Rotational symmetry

The Coulomb potential

$$V_C = \frac{\alpha}{\xi^2 + \eta^2} = \frac{\alpha}{r} \quad (60)$$

admits four linearly independent third-order integrals associated with constants A_{300} , A_{210} , A_{201} and A_{102} as well as a Killing vector associated with k_1 in

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= A_{210} \frac{\xi (2\alpha\eta^2 - h^2)}{4} - \eta A_{102}\alpha - A_{201} \frac{\eta (2\alpha\xi^2 + h^2)}{4} - k_1 \frac{\eta (\xi^2 + \eta^2)}{2} \\ G_2 &= -A_{210} \frac{\eta (2\alpha\xi^2 - h^2)}{4} + A_{102}\xi\alpha + A_{201} \frac{\xi (2\alpha\xi^2 - h^2)}{4} + k_1 \frac{\xi (\xi^2 + \eta^2)}{2}. \end{aligned}$$

2. Translation symmetry

The first potential is

$$V_{T,y} = \frac{\alpha}{\xi^2\eta^2} = \frac{\alpha}{y^2}. \quad (61)$$

It admits 4 linearly independent constants of the motion associated with the constants A_{012} , A_{030} , A_{111} , A_{210} and a Killing vector associated with k_1 , with functions

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= \frac{\alpha (\eta^4 + \xi^4) A_{210}}{2\xi\eta^2} - \frac{\alpha (\eta - \xi) (\eta + \xi) A_{111}}{\xi\eta^2} + 2 \frac{A_{012}\alpha}{\xi\eta^2} + k_1 \xi \\ G_2 &= -\frac{\alpha (\eta^4 + \xi^4) A_{210}}{2\eta\xi^2} + \frac{\alpha (\eta - \xi) (\eta + \xi) A_{111}}{\eta\xi^2} - 2 \frac{A_{012}\alpha}{\eta\xi^2} - k_1 \eta. \end{aligned}$$

The potential

$$V_{T,y,h} = \frac{h^2}{\xi^2\eta^2} = \frac{h^2}{y^2} \quad (62)$$

admits 8 linearly independent third-order constants of the motion associated with constants A_{003} , A_{012} , A_{030} , A_{102} , A_{111} , A_{201} , A_{210} , and A_{300} as well as a Killing vector associated with the constant k_1 . The G 's are

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= \frac{h^2 (3\eta^4 - \xi^4) A_{201}}{4\eta\xi^2} + \frac{h^2 (\eta^4 + \xi^4) A_{210}}{2\xi\eta^2} - \frac{h^2 (3\eta^6 + 5\xi^2\eta^4 + 5\xi^4\eta^2 + 3\xi^6) A_{300}}{8\eta\xi^2} + \xi k_1 \\ G_2 &= \frac{h^2 (3\xi^4 - \eta^4) A_{201}}{4\xi\eta^2} - \frac{h^2 (\eta^4 + \xi^4) A_{210}}{2\eta\xi^2} + \frac{h^2 (3\eta^6 + 5\xi^2\eta^4 + 5\xi^4\eta^2 + 3\xi^6) A_{300}}{8\xi\eta^2} - \eta k_1. \end{aligned}$$

Finally, the potential

$$V_{T,x} = \alpha(\xi^2 - \eta^2) = 2\alpha x \quad (63)$$

admits four linearly independent third-order integrals associated with constants A_{003} , A_{102} , A_{021} , A_{012} and a Killing vector associated with k_1 , with

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= -\eta^3\xi^2 A_{102}\alpha - 2\eta^3 A_{021}\alpha + 2\eta^2\xi A_{012}\alpha + 2\eta\xi^2 A_{021}\alpha + \eta k_1 \\ G_2 &= -\xi^3 A_{102}\alpha, \eta^2 + 2\xi^3 A_{021}\alpha + 2\eta A_{012}\xi^2\alpha - 2\xi A_{21}\alpha, \eta^2 + \xi k_1. \end{aligned}$$

VI. CONCLUSIONS

The main conclusion of this article is a negative one: all third-order integrals for potentials separating in parabolic coordinates in $E_2(\mathbb{R})$ are reducible. The corresponding potentials allow separation of variables in at least two coordinate systems and are already known to be quadratically superintegrable^{8,38}. Thus V_1 (54) is a deformed anisotropic harmonic oscillator, separable also in Cartesian coordinates. The potential V_2 (55) is a deformed Coulomb potential, separable also in polar coordinates. The potential V_3 (56) is a different deformation of the Coulomb potential, separable in two different parabolic coordinate systems (with the directrix of the parabolas either along the x or the y axis). Since these potentials are second-order superintegrable, they are the same in classical and quantum mechanics.

This is in stark contrast with the results obtained in the case of potentials separating in Cartesian¹⁰ or polar coordinates³⁶. There the results were much richer, mainly because of the role played by the linear compatibility condition (13).

Indeed, let us first consider a potential separating in Cartesian coordinates $V = W_1(x) + W_2(y)$. The linear compatibility conditions for this potential, written in Cartesian coordinates is given by

$$\begin{aligned} -F_3 W_{1,xxx} + 2(F_{2,y} - F_{3,x}) W_{1,xx} - (3F_{1,yy} - 2F_{2,xy} + F_{3,xx}) W_{1,x} = \\ F_2 W_{2,yyy} + (F_{2,y} - F_{3,x}) W_{2,yy} + (F_{2,yy} - 2F_{3,xy} + 3F_{4,xx}) W_{2y} \end{aligned} \quad (64)$$

with

$$\begin{aligned} F_1 &= A_{300}y^3 + A_{210}y^2 - A_{120}y + A_{030} \\ F_2 &= 3A_{300}xy^2 - 2A_{210}xy + A_{201}y^2 + A_{120}x - A_{111}y + A_{021} \\ F_3 &= -3A_{300}x^2y + A_{210}x^2 - 2A_{201}xy + A_{111}x - A_{102}y + A_{012} \\ F_4 &= A_{300}x^3 + A_{201}x^2 + A_{102}x + A_{003}. \end{aligned}$$

Differentiating (64) twice with respect to x gives two linear ODEs for W_1 :

$$(3A_{300}x^2 + 2A_{201}x + A_{102}) W_1^{(5)} + (36A_{300}x + 12A_{201}) W_1^{(4)} + 84A_{300} W_1^{(3)} = 0, \quad (65)$$

$$(-A_{111}x - A_{210}x^2 - A_{012}) W_1^{(5)} + (-12A_{210}x - 6A_{111}) W_1^{(4)} - 28A_{210} W_1^{(3)} = 0. \quad (66)$$

Differentiating (64) twice with respect to y gives two linear ODEs for W_2 :

$$(3A_{300}y^2 - 2A_{210}y + A_{120}) W_2^{(5)} + (36A_{300}y - 12A_{210}) W_2^{(4)} + 90A_{300} W_2^{(3)} = 0 \quad (67)$$

$$(A_{201}y^2 - A_{111}y + A_{021})W_2^{(5)} + (12A_{201}y - 6A_{111})W_2^{(4)} + 30A_{201}W_2^{(3)} = 0. \quad (68)$$

Interesting potentials in quantum mechanics, involving elliptic functions or Painlevé transcendents are obtained if either of these pairs of linear equations are satisfied trivially, i.e. if the coefficients in (65-66) or (67-68) vanish identically. Both systems of equations (65-68) vanish identically if and only if the only non-zero coefficients A_{jkl} are A_{030} and A_{003} . The potential in this case is for instance¹⁰

$$V(x, y) = \hbar^2 [\omega_1^2 P_I(\omega_1 x) + \omega_2^2 P_I(\omega_1 y)],$$

where P_I is the first Painlevé transcendent¹⁴. If, for example, (67-68) are satisfied trivially but (65-66) are not, this leads to potentials of the form¹⁰

$$V(x, y) = ay + (2\hbar^2 b^2)^{1/3} \left[P'_{II} \left(- \left(\frac{4b}{\hbar^2} \right)^{1/3} x, k \right) + P_{II}^2 \left(- \frac{4b}{\hbar^2} x, k \right) \right],$$

where P_{II} is the second Painlevé transcendent¹⁴.

Now, let us consider potentials allowing separation of variables in polar coordinates³⁶

$$V = R(r) + \frac{1}{r^2} S(\theta). \quad (69)$$

The linear compatibility condition reduces to

$$\begin{aligned} 0 = & r^4 F_3 R''' + (2r^4 F_{3,r} - 2r^2 F_{2,\theta} + 3r(2r^2 F_3 - F_1)) R'' \\ & + (r^4 F_{3,rr} + 2r^2(3F_{3,r} + 3F_3 - F_{2,r\theta}) - 4rF_{2,\theta} + 3F_{1,\theta\theta}) R' \\ & + \frac{1}{r^2} F_2 S''' - \frac{1}{r^3} (2r^3 F_{3,r} - 2rF_{2,\theta} + 6F_1) S'' \\ & + \frac{1}{r^3} (3r^5 F_{4,rr} + 6r^4 F_{4,r} - 2r^3 F_{3,r\theta} + 3r^2 F_{2,r} + r(F_{2,\theta\theta} - 2F_2) - 12F_{1,\theta}) S' \\ & - \frac{1}{r^3} (2r^4 F_{3,rr} - 12r^3 F_{3,r} + 4r^2(3F_{3,r} - F_{2,r\theta}) + 4rF_{2,\theta} + 6F_{1,\theta\theta} + 18F_1) S \end{aligned}, \quad (70)$$

where here the F_i 's are given by

$$\begin{aligned} F_1 &= A_1 \cos 3\theta + A_2 \sin 3\theta + A_3 \cos \theta + A_4 \sin \theta \\ F_2 &= \frac{-3A_1 \sin 3\theta + 3A_2 \cos 3\theta - A_3 \cos \theta + A_4 \sin \theta}{r} + B_1 \cos 2\theta + B_2 \sin 2\theta + B_0 \\ F_3 &= \frac{-3A_1 \cos 3\theta - 3A_2 \sin 3\theta + A_3 \cos \theta + A_4 \sin \theta}{r^2} + \frac{-2B_1 \sin 2\theta + 2B_2 \cos 2\theta}{r} + C_1 \cos \theta + C_2 \sin \theta \\ F_4 &= \frac{A_1 \sin 3\theta - A_2 \cos 3\theta - A_3 \sin \theta + A_4 \cos \theta}{r^3} - \frac{B_1 \cos 2\theta + B_2 \sin 2\theta + B_0}{r^2} - \frac{C_1 \sin \theta - C_2 \cos \theta}{r} + D_0, \end{aligned}$$

with

$$\begin{aligned} A_1 &= \frac{A_{030} - A_{012}}{4}, \quad A_2 = \frac{A_{021} - A_{003}}{4}, \quad A_3 = \frac{3A_{030} + A_{012}}{4}, \\ A_4 &= \frac{3A_{003} + A_{021}}{4}, \quad B_1 = \frac{A_{120} - A_{102}}{2}, \quad B_2 = \frac{A_{111}}{2}, \quad B_0 = \frac{A_{120} + A_{102}}{2}, \\ C_1 &= A_{210}, \quad C_2 = A_{201}, \quad D_0 = A_{300}. \end{aligned}$$

Equation (70) is satisfied trivially if all the $A_{jkl} = 0$ except A_{300} . This leads to the potential³⁶

$$V(r, \theta) = R(r) + \frac{\hbar^2}{r^2} P(\theta, t_2, t_3),$$

where $R(r)$ is arbitrary and $P(\theta, t_2, t_3)$ is the Weierstrass elliptic function³. This potential allows a third-order integral, however it is algebraically related to the second-order one and the system is hence not superintegrable. If however we consider the subcase $R(r) = 0$, Eq. (70) simplifies. It being satisfied trivially allows further constants in the integral to be nonzero, namely A_{300} , A_{210} and A_{201} . This leads to a superintegrable potential expressed in terms of the sixth Painlevé transcendent¹⁴, $P_{VI}(\sin \theta/2)$.

In section III, we have shown that the linear compatibility condition (13) is never satisfied trivially for a potential separating in parabolic coordinates. This rules out any dependence of W_1 and W_2 on elliptic functions or Painlevé transcendents.

In addition to the real potentials presented in section V, we have recovered a complex one (see Appendix B) which is known to be superintegrable²². It can be transformed into a real form; however, it will live on the pseudo-Euclidean plane $E(1, 1)$ rather than the Euclidean one.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank F. Tremblay for helpful discussions. SP acknowledges a postdoctoral fellowship provided by the Laboratory of Mathematical Physics of the Centre de Recherches Mathématiques, Université de Montréal. The research of PW is partially supported by the National Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of Canada.

Appendix A: System of linear ODEs for W_1 and W_2

The linear compatibility condition (13), implies (by differentiation) two systems of 14 ODEs for W_1 and W_2 , respectively. Those for W_1 are given below and those for W_2 can be obtained from these under the interchange $\xi \rightarrow \eta$ and $A_{jkl} \rightarrow (-1)^{j+k} A_{jkl}$.

$$0 = A_{300} \left(\xi^2 W_1^{(17)} + 37\xi W_1^{(16)} + 323W_1^{(15)} \right) \quad (\text{A1})$$

$$0 = A_{210} \left(\xi W_1^{(17)} + 18W_1^{(16)} \right) \quad (A2)$$

$$0 = A_{210} \left(11 \xi^3 W_1^{(17)} + 503 \xi^2 W_1^{(16)} + 7145 \xi W_1^{(15)} + 31360 W_1^{(14)} \right) \quad (A3)$$

$$0 = -9A_{300} \left(\xi^4 W_1^{(17)} + 65 \xi^3 W_1^{(16)} + 1485 \xi^2 W_1^{(15)} + 14070 \xi W_1^{(14)} + 46410 W_1^{(13)} \right) \\ + (A_{201} \xi^2 - 2A_{120}) W_1^{(17)} - 33 \xi A_{201} W_1^{(16)} - 255 A_{201} W_1^{(15)}. \quad (A4)$$

$$0 = -\frac{45}{4} A_{300} \left(\xi^6 W_1^{(17)} + 93 \xi^5 W_1^{(16)} + 3375 \xi^4 W_1^{(15)} + 60900 \xi^3 W_1^{(14)} + 573300 \xi^2 W_1^{(13)} \right. \\ \left. + 2653560 \xi W_1^{(12)} + 4684680 W_1^{(11)} \right) \\ - A_{201} \left(\frac{5\xi^4}{2} W_1^{(17)} + \frac{301\xi^3}{2} W_1^{(16)} + \frac{6345\xi^2}{2} W_1^{(15)} + 27615 \xi W_1^{(14)} + 83265 W_1^{(13)} \right) \\ - A_{120} \left(6\xi^2 W_1^{(17)} + 169 \xi W_1^{(16)} + 1109 W_1^{(15)} \right) \\ + (\xi^2 A_{102} + 2A_{021}) W_1^{(17)} + 33 \xi A_{102} W_1^{(16)} + 255 A_{102} W_1^{(15)}. \quad (A5)$$

$$0 = -\frac{15}{2} A_{300} \left(\xi^8 W_1^{(17)} + 121 \xi^7 W_1^{(16)} + 5993 \xi^6 W_1^{(15)} + 157962 \xi^5 W_1^{(14)} + 2410590 \xi^4 W_1^{(13)} \right. \\ \left. + 21676200 \xi^3 W_1^{(12)} + 111351240 \xi^2 W_1^{(11)} + 296215920 \xi W_1^{(10)} + 309188880 W_1^{(9)} \right) \\ - A_{201} \left(\frac{5\xi^6}{2} W_1^{(17)} + \frac{437\xi^5}{2} W_1^{(16)} + \frac{14831\xi^4}{2} W_1^{(15)} + 124418 \xi^3 W_1^{(14)} \right. \\ \left. + 1081626 \xi^2 W_1^{(13)} + 4585308 \xi W_1^{(12)} + 7339332 W_1^{(11)} \right) \\ - A_{120} \left(7\xi^4 W_1^{(17)} + 388 \xi^3 W_1^{(16)} + 7464 \xi^2 W_1^{(15)} + 58632 \xi W_1^{(14)} + 157248 W_1^{(13)} \right) \\ + 2A_{102} \left(\xi^4 W_1^{(17)} + 58 \xi^3 W_1^{(16)} + 1170 \xi^2 W_1^{(15)} + 9660 \xi W_1^{(14)} + 27300 W_1^{(13)} \right) \\ + A_{021} \left(\xi^2 W_1^{(17)} - 11 \xi W_1^{(16)} - 409 W_1^{(15)} \right) \\ + A_{003} \left(3\xi^2 W_1^{(17)} + 111 \xi W_1^{(16)} + 969 W_1^{(15)} \right). \quad (A6)$$

$$0 = A_{210} \left(\frac{25\xi^5}{4} W_1^{(17)} + \frac{1839\xi^4}{4} W_1^{(16)} + \frac{50451\xi^3}{4} W_1^{(15)} + \frac{320901\xi^2}{2} W_1^{(14)} + \frac{1881243\xi}{2} W_1^{(13)} \right. \\ \left. + 2018016 W_1^{(12)} \right) \\ + (3 \xi A_{030} + 1/2 \xi^3 A_{111} - 2 \xi A_{012}) W_1^{(17)} + (54 A_{030} - 36 A_{012} + \frac{51}{2} \xi^2 A_{111}) W_1^{(16)} \\ + \frac{813}{2} W_1^{(15)} \xi A_{111} + 2016 W_1^{(14)} A_{111}. \quad (A7)$$

$$0 = \frac{1}{4} A_{210} \left(25 W_1^{(17)} \xi^5 + 1839 W_1^{(16)} \xi^4 + 50451 W_1^{(15)} \xi^3 + 641802 W_1^{(14)} \xi^2 + 3762486 W_1^{(13)} \xi \right. \\ \left. + 8072064 W_1^{(12)} \right) \\ + \frac{1}{2} A_{111} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^3 + 51 W_1^{(16)} \xi^2 + 813 W_1^{(15)} \xi + 4032 W_1^{(14)} \right) \\ + 3 A_{030} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi + 18 W_1^{(16)} \right) - 2 A_{012} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi + 18 W_1^{(16)} \right). \quad (A8)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
0 = & \frac{1}{2} A_{210} \left(15 W_1^{(17)} \xi^7 + 1523 W_1^{(16)} \xi^6 + 61761 W_1^{(15)} \xi^5 + 1289820 W_1^{(14)} \xi^4 + 14889420 W_1^{(13)} \xi^3 \right. \\
& \left. + 94316040 W_1^{(12)} \xi^2 + 300900600 W_1^{(11)} \xi + 369008640 W_1^{(10)} \right) \\
& + 2 A_{111} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^5 + 76 W_1^{(16)} \xi^4 + 2156 W_1^{(15)} \xi^3 + 28392 W_1^{(14)} \xi^2 + 172536 W_1^{(13)} \xi \right. \\
& \left. + 384384 W_1^{(12)} \right) \\
& - A_{012} \left(5 W_1^{(17)} \xi^3 + 173 W_1^{(16)} \xi^2 + 1475 W_1^{(15)} \xi + 1024 W_1^{(14)} \right) \\
& + 3 A_{030} \left(3 W_1^{(17)} \xi^3 + 115 W_1^{(16)} \xi^2 + 1249 W_1^{(15)} \xi + 3392 W_1^{(14)} \right). \tag{A9}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
0 = & -\frac{9}{4} A_{300} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^{12} + 177 W_1^{(16)} \xi^{11} + 13413 W_1^{(15)} \xi^{10} + 572670 W_1^{(14)} \xi^9 + 15257970 W_1^{(13)} \xi^8 \right. \\
& + 265552560 W_1^{(12)} \xi^7 + 3072429360 W_1^{(11)} \xi^6 + 23597814240 W_1^{(10)} \xi^5 \\
& + 118118800800 W_1^{(9)} \xi^4 + 370767196800 W_1^{(8)} \xi^3 + 681080400000 W_1^{(7)} \xi^2 \\
& \left. + 642939897600 W_1^{(6)} \xi + 228843014400 W_1^{(5)} \right) \\
& - \frac{1}{4} A_{201} \left(5 W_1^{(17)} \xi^{10} + 709 W_1^{(16)} \xi^9 + 42051 W_1^{(15)} \xi^8 + 1365672 W_1^{(14)} \xi^7 \right. \\
& + 26708136 W_1^{(13)} \xi^6 + 325909584 W_1^{(12)} \xi^5 + 2487204720 W_1^{(11)} \xi^4 \\
& + 11568997440 W_1^{(10)} \xi^3 + 30849698880 W_1^{(9)} \xi^2 \\
& \left. + 41565363840 W_1^{(8)} \xi + 20704844160 W_1^{(7)} \right) \\
& - \frac{1}{2} A_{120} \left(9 W_1^{(17)} \xi^8 + 976 W_1^{(16)} \xi^7 + 42728 W_1^{(15)} \xi^6 + 978432 W_1^{(14)} \xi^5 + 12689040 W_1^{(13)} \xi^4 \right. \\
& \left. + 94174080 W_1^{(12)} \xi^3 + 383423040 W_1^{(11)} \xi^2 + 761080320 W_1^{(10)} \xi + 536215680 W_1^{(9)} \right) \\
& + 2 A_{102} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^8 + 108 W_1^{(16)} \xi^7 + 4704 W_1^{(15)} \xi^6 + 107016 W_1^{(14)} \xi^5 + 1375920 W_1^{(13)} \xi^4 \right. \\
& \left. + 10090080 W_1^{(12)} \xi^3 + 40360320 W_1^{(11)} \xi^2 + 77837760 W_1^{(10)} \xi + 51891840 W_1^{(9)} \right) \\
& - A_{021} \left(5 W_1^{(17)} \xi^6 + 393 W_1^{(16)} \xi^5 + 11511 W_1 \xi^{(15)} + 157140 W_1^{(14)} \xi^3 + 1016820 W_1^{(13)} \xi^2 \right. \\
& \left. + 2784600 W_1^{(12)} \xi + 2325960 W_1^{(11)} \right) \\
& + 9 A_{003} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^6 + 77 W_1^{(16)} \xi^5 + 2223 W_1^{(15)} \xi^4 + 30180 W_1^{(14)} \xi^3 + 196980 W_1^{(13)} \xi^2 \right. \\
& \left. + 556920 W_1^{(12)} \xi + 491400 W_1^{(11)} \right). \tag{A10}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
0 = & -\frac{45}{8}A_{300} \left(\xi^{10}W_1^{(17)} + 149\xi^9W_1^{(16)} + 9339\xi^8W_1^{(15)} + 322728\xi^7W_1^{(14)} \right. \\
& + 6772584\xi^6W_1^{(13)} + 89618256\xi^5W_1^{(12)} + 751710960\xi^4W_1^{(11)} + 3912068160\xi^3W_1^{(10)} \\
& + 11961069120\xi^2W_1^{(9)} + 19148088960\xi W_1^{(8)} + 11987015040W_1^{(7)} \Big) \\
& - A_{201} \left(\frac{5\xi^8}{2}W_1^{(17)} + \frac{573\xi^7}{2}W_1^{(16)} + \frac{26733\xi^6}{2}W_1^{(15)} + 329721\xi^5W_1^{(14)} + 4672395\xi^4W_1^{(13)} \right. \\
& + 38640420\xi^3W_1^{(12)} + 180360180\xi^2W_1^{(11)} + 429188760\xi W_1^{(10)} + 392432040W_1^{(9)} \Big) \\
& - A_{120} \left(8\xi^6W_1^{(17)} + 657\xi^5W_1^{(16)} + 20769\xi^4W_1^{(15)} + 320964\xi^3W_1^{(14)} + 2532348\xi^2W_1^{(13)} \right. \\
& + 9546264\xi W_1^{(12)} + 13189176W_1^{(11)} \Big) \\
& + 3A_{102} \left(\xi^6W_1^{(17)} + 83\xi^5W_1^{(16)} + 2653\xi^4W_1^{(15)} + 41468\xi^3W_1^{(14)} \right. \\
& + 330876\xi^2W_1^{(13)} + 1260168\xi W_1^{(12)} + 1753752W_1^{(11)} \Big) \\
& - 3A_{021} \left(\xi^4W_1^{(17)} + 71\xi^3W_1^{(16)} + 1583\xi^2W_1^{(15)} + 12858\xi W_1^{(14)} + 29022W_1^{(13)} \right) \\
& + 9A_{003} \left(\xi^4W_1^{(17)} + 57\xi^3W_1^{(16)} + 1093\xi^2W_1^{(15)} + 8070\xi W_1^{(14)} + 17850W_1^{(13)} \right). \tag{A11}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
0 = & \frac{-8}{3} A_{300} \left(\xi^{14} W_1^{(17)} + 205 \xi^{13} W_1^{(16)} + 18215 \xi^{(12)} W_1^{(15)} + 925260 \xi^{11} W_1^{(14)} \right. \\
& + 29849820 \xi^{10} W_1^{(13)} + 642762120 \xi^9 W_1^{(12)} + 9454044600 \xi^8 W_1^{(11)} + 95610715200 \xi^7 W_1^{(10)} \\
& + 660712852800 \xi^6 W_1^{(9)} + 3062396937600 \xi^5 W_1^{(8)} + 9210023222400 \xi^4 W_1^{(7)} \\
& + 17036091072000 \xi^3 W_1^{(6)} + 17762576832000 \xi^2 W_1^{(5)} \\
& \left. + 8935774848000 \xi W_1^{(4)} + 1525620096000 W_1^{(3)} \right) \\
& - \frac{1}{4} A_{201} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^{12} + 169 W_1^{(16)} \xi^{11} + 12157 W_1^{(15)} \xi^{10} + 489230 W_1^{(14)} \xi^9 + 12178530 W_1^{(13)} \xi^8 \right. \\
& + 195839280 W_1^{(12)} \xi^7 + 2063421360 W_1^{(11)} \xi^6 + 14153499360 W_1^{(10)} \xi^5 \\
& + 61556695200 W_1^{(9)} \xi^4 + 161124163200 W_1^{(8)} \xi^3 + 230659228800 W_1^{(7)} \xi^2 \\
& \left. + 148929580800 W_1^{(6)} \xi + 25427001600 W_1^{(5)} \right) \\
& - \frac{1}{2} A_{120} \left(2 W_1^{(17)} \xi^{10} + 269 W_1^{(16)} \xi^9 + 15009 W_1^{(15)} \xi^8 + 453768 W_1^{(14)} \xi^7 + 8148504 W_1^{(13)} \xi^6 \right. \\
& + 89618256 W_1^{(12)} \xi^5 + 600359760 W_1^{(11)} \xi^4 + 2355312960 W_1^{(10)} \xi^3 + 4955670720 W_1^{(9)} \xi^2 \\
& \left. + 4618373760 W_1^{(8)} \xi + 1089728640 W_1^{(7)} \right) \\
& + \frac{1}{2} A_{102} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^{10} + 133 W_1^{(16)} \xi^9 + 7323 W_1^{(15)} \xi^8 + 217896 W_1^{(14)} \xi^7 + 3837288 W_1^{(13)} \xi^6 \right. \\
& + 41185872 W_1^{(12)} \xi^5 + 267387120 W_1^{(11)} \xi^4 + 1006125120 W_1^{(10)} \xi^3 + 1997835840 W_1^{(9)} \xi^2 \\
& \left. + 1712430720 W_1^{(8)} \xi + 363242880 W_1^{(7)} \right) \\
& - A_{021} \left(2 W_1^{(17)} \xi^8 + 191 W_1^{(16)} \xi^7 + 7171 W_1^{(15)} \xi^6 + 135846 W_1^{(14)} \xi^5 + 1385370 W_1^{(13)} \xi^4 \right. \\
& \left. + 7502040 W_1^{(12)} \xi^3 + 19819800 W_1^{(11)} \xi^2 + 20900880 W_1^{(10)} \xi + 5045040 W_1^{(9)} \right) \\
& + 3 A_{003} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^8 + 97 W_1^{(16)} \xi^7 + 3713 W_1^{(15)} \xi^6 + 72090 W_1^{(14)} \xi^5 + 759150 W_1^{(13)} \xi^4 \right. \\
& \left. + 4291560 W_1^{(12)} \xi^3 + 12022920 W_1^{(11)} \xi^2 + 13693680 W_1^{(10)} \xi + 3603600 W_1^{(9)} \right). \\
0 = & \frac{1}{2} A_{210} \left(10 W_1^{(17)} \xi^9 + 1297 W_1^{(16)} \xi^8 + 69655 W_1^{(15)} \xi^7 + 2022230 W_1^{(14)} \xi^6 + 34761090 W_1^{(13)} \xi^5 \right. \\
& + 364236600 W_1^{(12)} \xi^4 + 2306424120 W_1^{(11)} \xi^3 + 8421613200 W_1^{(10)} \xi^2 \\
& \left. + 15881065200 W_1^{(9)} \xi + 11589177600 W_1^{(8)} \right) \\
& + 3 A_{111} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^7 + 101 W_1^{(16)} \xi^6 + 4067 W_1^{(15)} \xi^5 + 84140 W_1^{(14)} \xi^4 + 959140 W_1^{(13)} \xi^3 \right. \\
& \left. + 5973240 W_1^{(12)} \xi^2 + 18618600 W_1^{(11)} \xi + 22102080 W_1^{(10)} \right) \tag{A13} \\
& + 9 A_{030} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^5 + 59 W_1^{(16)} \xi^4 + 1227 W_1^{(15)} \xi^3 + 10946 W_1^{(14)} \xi^2 + 40838 W_1^{(13)} \xi \right. \\
& \left. + 53872 W_1^{(12)} \right) \\
& - 3 A_{012} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^5 + 41 W_1^{(16)} \xi^4 + 273 W_1^{(15)} \xi^3 - 6146 W_1^{(14)} \xi^2 - 78638 W_1^{(13)} \xi \right. \\
& \left. - 206752 W_1^{(12)} \right).
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
0 = & \frac{1}{4} A_{210} \left(7 W_1^{(17)} \xi^{11} + 1107 W_1^{(16)} \xi^{10} + 74133 W_1^{(15)} \xi^9 + 2760408 W_1^{(14)} \xi^8 \right. \\
& + 63115416 W_1^{(13)} \xi^7 + 923792688 W_1^{(12)} \xi^6 + 8757180432 W_1^{(11)} \xi^5 + 53215081920 W_1^{(10)} \xi^4 \\
& + 200587907520 W_1^{(9)} \xi^3 + 439575776640 W_1^{(8)} \xi^2 + 493647073920 W_1^{(7)} \xi \\
& \left. + 209227898880 W_1^{(6)} \right) \\
& + 2 A_{111} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^9 + 126 W_1^{(16)} \xi^8 + 6546 W_1^{(15)} \xi^7 + 182868 W_1^{(14)} \xi^6 + 3004092 W_1^{(13)} \xi^5 \right. \\
& + 29811600 W_1^{(12)} \xi^4 + 176576400 W_1^{(11)} \xi^3 + 592431840 W_1^{(10)} \xi^2 + 998917920 W_1^{(9)} \xi \\
& \left. + 622702080 W_1^{(8)} \right) \quad (A14) \\
& + 3 A_{030} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^7 + 81 W_1^{(16)} \xi^6 + 2535 W_1^{(15)} \xi^5 + 39444 W_1^{(14)} \xi^4 + 329364 W_1^{(13)} \xi^3 \right. \\
& + 1500408 W_1^{(12)} \xi^2 + 3583944 W_1^{(11)} \xi + 3459456 W_1^{(10)} \left. \right) \\
& + A_{012} \left(W_1^{(17)} \xi^7 + 129 W_1^{(16)} \xi^6 + 6027 W_1^{(15)} \xi^5 + 134484 W_1^{(14)} \xi^4 + 1544004 W_1^{(13)} \xi^3 \right. \\
& \left. + 8969688 W_1^{(12)} \xi^2 + 23633064 W_1^{(11)} \xi + 20756736 W_1^{(10)} \right).
\end{aligned}$$

Appendix B: Complex potentials and superintegrable systems in $E(1,1)$ admitting separation in parabolic coordinates

As a byproduct of this study, we have obtained a complex potential in E_2 that can be viewed as real potential in the pseudo-Euclidean place $E(1,1)$. This is the only complex potential in Ref. 22 which is separable in parabolic coordinates and does not admit a Killing vector. We also give the subcase of this potential which admits a Killing vector and its third-order integrals.

1. System admitting a single third-order integral: V_4

The following potential

$$\begin{aligned}
V_4 = & -\alpha(\xi^2 - \eta^2) + \beta \frac{(\xi^2 + i\xi\eta - \eta^2)}{\xi + i\eta} + \frac{\gamma}{\xi + i\eta}, \quad (B1) \\
= & 2\alpha x - \frac{\beta(2x + iy)}{\sqrt{x + iy}} - \frac{\gamma}{\sqrt{x + iy}} \\
= & 2\alpha r \cos(\theta) - \frac{r(2\cos\theta + i\sin\theta)\beta + \gamma}{\sqrt{r(\cos\theta + i\sin\theta)}}
\end{aligned}$$

admits one third-order integral with $A_3 = -A_{021}$, $A_{012} = 2iA_{021}$ and the remained $A_{jkl} = 0$. The functions G_1 and G_2 are given by

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= i \left(-2i\eta\alpha\xi^2 + 4\xi\alpha\eta^2 - 2i\eta\xi\beta + 2i\alpha\eta^3 + \eta^2\beta + \gamma \right) A_{021} \\ G_2 &= \left(-2\xi\alpha\eta^2 + 4i\eta\alpha\xi^2 + 2i\eta\xi\beta + 2\xi^3\alpha + \beta\xi^2 - \gamma \right) A_{021}. \end{aligned}$$

Putting $iy = t$, we obtain a superintegrable system in $E(1, 1)$; namely,

$$H = \frac{1}{2}(p_x^2 - p_t^2) + 2\alpha x - \frac{\beta(2x+t)}{\sqrt{x+t}} - \frac{\gamma}{\sqrt{x+t}}. \quad (\text{B2})$$

2. System admitting group symmetry

A special case of the previous potential admits a Killing vector. The potential is:

$$V_L = \frac{\gamma}{\xi + i\eta}. \quad (\text{B3})$$

The third-order integral is defined by the following non-zero A_{jkl} , along with an arbitrary constant k_1 which is the coefficient of the Killing vector

$$A_{003} = A_{030} = \frac{A_{021} + 2iA_{012}}{3}, A_{120} = -iA_{111} + A_{102}, A_{102}, A_{111}, A_{021}, A_{012},$$

$$\begin{aligned} G_1 &= \gamma A_{012} + i\gamma A_{021} + i\gamma(\xi + i\eta)^2 A_{102} - \frac{\gamma}{2}(\xi^2 - \eta^2) A_{111} + k_1(\xi + i\eta) \\ G_2 &= i\gamma A_{012} + \gamma A_{021} + \frac{\gamma}{2}(\xi + i\eta)^2 A_{102} - \frac{i\gamma}{2}(\xi^2 - \eta^2) A_{111} + ik_1(\xi + i\eta). \end{aligned}$$

REFERENCES

- ¹Bargmann, V., “Zur theorie des Wasserstoffatoms,” *Zeitschrift für Physik* **99**, 576–582 (1936).
- ²Bertrand, J., “Théorème relatif au mouvement d’un point attiré vers un centre fixe,” *C. R. Acad. Sci.* **77**, 849 – 853 (1873).
- ³Byrd, P. and Friedman, M., *Handbook of Elliptic Integrals for Engineers and Students* (Springer-Verlag, New York, 1972).
- ⁴Chanu, C., Degiovanni, L., and Rastelli, G., “Polynomial constants of motion for Calogero-type systems in three dimensions,” *J. Math. Phys.* **52**, 032903 (2011).

- ⁵Drach, J., “Sur l’intégration logique des équations de la dynamique á deux variables: Forces conservatives. Intégrales cubiques. Mouvements dans le plan.” C.R. Acad. Sci. **200**, 22–26 (1935).
- ⁶Evans, N. W., “Superintegrability in classical mechanics,” Phys. Rev. A. **41**, 5668–70 (1990).
- ⁷Fock, V., “Zur theorie des Wasserstoffatoms,” Zeitschrift für Physik **98**, 145–154 (1935).
- ⁸Fris, I., Mandrosov, V., Smorodinsky, J. A., Uhlír, M., and Winternitz, P., “On higher symmetries in quantum mechanics,” Phys. Lett. **16**, 354–356 (1965).
- ⁹Goldstein, H., Poole, C. P., and Safko, J. L., *Classical Mechanics*, 3rd ed. (Addison Wesley, 2001).
- ¹⁰Gravel, S., “Hamiltonians separable in Cartesian coordinates and third-order integrals of motion.” J. Math Phys. **45**, 1003–1019 (2004).
- ¹¹Gravel, S. and Winternitz, P., “Superintegrability with third-order integrals in quantum and classical mechanics.” J. Math. Phys. **46**, 5902 (2002).
- ¹²Hietarinta, J., “Classical versus quantum integrability,” J. Math. Phys. **25**, 1833–1840 (1984).
- ¹³Hietarinta, J. and Grammaticos, B., “On the $\hbar^2$ -correction terms in quantum mechanics,” J. Phys. A **22**, 1315–1322 (1989).
- ¹⁴Ince, E., *Ordinary Differential Equations* (Dover, New York, 1972).
- ¹⁵Jauch, J. and Hill, E., “On the problem of degeneracy in quantum mechanics,” Phys. Rev **57**, 641–645 (1940).
- ¹⁶Kalnins, E. G., Kress, J., Miller Jr., W., and Winternitz, P., “Superintegrable systems in Darboux spaces,” J. Math. Phys. **44**, 5811–5848 (2003).
- ¹⁷Kalnins, E. G., Kress, J., and Miller Jr., W., “Second order superintegrable systems in conformally flat spaces. i: 2d classical structure theory,” J. Math. Phys. **46**, 053509 (2005).
- ¹⁸Kalnins, E. G., Kress, J., and Miller Jr., W., “Second order superintegrable systems in conformally flat spaces. v. 2d and 3d quantum systems,” J. Math Phys. **47**, 093501 (2006).
- ¹⁹Kalnins, E. G., Kress, J., and Miller Jr., W., “A recurrence relation approach to higher order quantum superintegrability,” SIGMA **7**, 031 (2011).
- ²⁰Kalnins, E. G., Kress, J. M., and Miller Jr., W., “Families of classical superintegrable systems,” J. Phys. A **43**, 092001 (2010).

- ²¹Kalnins, E. G., Kress, J. M., and Miller Jr., W., “Superintegrability and higher order constants for quantum systems,” J. Phys. A **43**, 265205 (2010).
- ²²Kalnins, E. G., Miller Jr., W., and Pogosyan, G. S., “Completeness of multiseparable superintegrability in two dimensions,” Phys. Atomic Nuclei **6**, 1033–1035 (2002).
- ²³Maciejewski, A. J., Przybylska, M., and Yoshida, H., “Necessary conditions for classical super-integrability of a certain family of potentials in constant curvature spaces,” J. Phys. A **43**, 382001 (2010).
- ²⁴Makarov, A. A., Smorodinsky, J. A., Valiev, K., and Winternitz, P., “A systematic search for nonrelativistic systems with dynamical symmetries,” Il Nuovo Cimento A **52**, 1061–1084 (1967).
- ²⁵Marquette, I., “Superintegrability with third order integrals of motion, cubic algebras, and supersymmetric quantum mechanics. ii. Painlevé transcendent potentials,” J. Math. Phys. **50**, 095202 (2009).
- ²⁶Marquette, I., “Supersymmetry as a method of obtaining new superintegrable systems with higher order integrals of motion,” J. Math. Phys. **50**, 122102 (2009).
- ²⁷Marquette, I. and Winternitz, P., “Superintegrable systems with third order integrals of motion,” J. Phys. A , 303031–41 (2008).
- ²⁸Moshinsky, M. and Smirnov, Y., *The Harmonic Oscillator in Modern Physics*, Vol. 9 (Amsterdam, Harwood Academic Publishers, 1996).
- ²⁹Post, S. and Winternitz, P., “An infinite family of superintegrable deformations of the Coulomb potential,” J. Phys. A. **42**, 222001 (2010).
- ³⁰Quesne, C., “Superintegrability of the Tremblay-Turbiner-Winternitz quantum Hamiltonian on a plane for odd k ,” J.Phys. A. **43**, 082001 (2010).
- ³¹Rañada, M., “Superintegrable $n=2$ systems, quadratic constants of motion, and potentials of Drach,” J. Math. Phys. **38**, 4165–4178 (1997).
- ³²Rañada, M., “Master symmetries, non-Hamiltonian symmetries and superintegrability of the generalized Smorodinsky-Winternitz,” J. Phys. A **45**, 145204 (2012).
- ³³Tempesta, P., Winternitz, P., Miller, W., and Pogosyan, G., eds., *Superintegrability in Classical and Quantum Systems*, CRM Proceedings and Lecture Notes, Vol. 37 (AMS, 2004).
- ³⁴Tremblay, F., Turbiner, A., and Winternitz, P., “An infinite family of solvable and integrable quantum systems on a plane,” J. Phys. A **42**, 242001 (2009).

- ³⁵Tremblay, F., Turbiner, A. V., and Winternitz, P., “Periodic orbits for an infinite family of classical superintegrable systems,” J. Phys. A **43**, 051202 (2010).
- ³⁶Tremblay, F. and Winternitz, P., “Third order superintegrable systems separating in polar coordinates,” J. Phys. A **43**, 175206 (2010).
- ³⁷Tsiganov, A., “Canonical transformations of the extended phase space, Toda lattices and Stäckel family of integrable systems,” J. Phys. A. **33**, 4169–4182 (1999).
- ³⁸Winternitz, P., Smorodinsky, J. A., Uhlir, M., and Fris, I., “Symmetry groups in classical and quantum mechanics,” Yad Fiz **4**, 625–635 (1966), (1966 Sov. J. Nucl. Phys. 4 444-50).